Online Appendix of ‘When the Stakes are High’, by Annemarie Walter, Wouter van der Brug and Philip van Praag, accepted for publication by CPS

Table A.1. Distribution of Party Election Broadcasts included for Britain

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conservatives (CON)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour (LAB)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberal Democrats (LDP)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: Total of 84 party election broadcasts. Source: Leeds University Election Broadcast Archive, British Film Institute, private collection of Dr. Margaret Scammell (London School of Economics) and transcripts of Dr. Michael Pearce (University of Sunderland)*

Table A.2. Distribution of Party Election Broadcasts included for Germany

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Christian Democratic Union (CDU)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christian Social Union (CSU)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free Democratic Party (FDP)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Greens (Die Grünen)</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Party of Democratic Socialism (PDS)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Democratic Party of Germany (SPD)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>23</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: Total of 156 party election broadcasts. - Party did not exist at that time. *Party election broadcasts for this party were available, but are not included as the party was not represented in parliament during the election campaign. Source: Archive of Social Democracy of the Friedrich Ebert Foundation, Archive of Liberalism of the Friedrich Naumann Foundation, the Green Memory Archive of the Heinrich Böll Foundation, the Archive of Christian Democratic Politics of the Konrad Adenauer Foundation, Archive of Democratic Socialism of the Rosa Luxemburg Foundation, Archive for Christian Social Politics of the Hans Seidel Foundation and production company Trialon.*
Table A.3. Distribution of Party Election Broadcasts included for the Netherlands

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General Old People Party (AOV)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centre Party/Centre Democrats (CD)</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christian Democratic Appeal (CDA)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communist Party in the Netherlands (CPN)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christian Union (CU)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democrats'66 (D66)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democratic Socialists '70 (DS'70)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelical People’s Party (EVP)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Left (GL)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reformed Political League (GPV)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List Pim Fortuyn (LPF) / List Five Fortuyn (LVF)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liveable Netherlands (LN)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radical Party (PPR)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pacifist Socialist Party (PSP)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour Party (PvdA)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal Party (PvdD)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freedom Party (PVV)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reformed Political Federation (RPF)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socialist Party (SP)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberal Party (VVD)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Union 55+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Total of 137 party election broadcast, several party election broadcasts have not been saved in archives. - Party did not exist at that time. N/A = Not available, as several party election broadcasts have not been saved. The Political Reformed Party (SGP) that is represented in the Dutch Parliament does not make use of the free allocated broadcast time, due to religious objections. In 2002 the campaign ended prematurely due to the assassination of LPF first candidate Pim Fortuyn, thereby reducing the number of different party election broadcasts aired. Source: The Netherlands Institute of Sound and Vision, Documentation Centre Dutch Political Parties, collection Communication Sciences University of Nijmegen, The Historical Documentation Centre for Dutch Protestantism, The Archives and Documentation Center of the Reformed Churches (liberated) in the Netherlands, International Institute of Social History, Archive Socialist Party (SP), YouTube channel Christian Democrats (CDA), YouTube channel Green Left (GL).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Dev.</th>
<th>Min.</th>
<th>Max.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Party x Election Level (N=141)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opposition Party (dummy)</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Party Loss in the Polls</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>3.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government Experience</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median Party Distance</td>
<td>1.58</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>3.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Election Level (N=23)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Size Electoral Market</td>
<td>10.60</td>
<td>7.49</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>31.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closeness Election</td>
<td>9.95</td>
<td>7.19</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>27.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuation Government (dummy)</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coalition Loss (dummy)</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuation Government* Coalition Loss</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table A.5. The Effects of Party Characteristics on Negative Campaigning in Western Europe

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Base Model</th>
<th>Model 1 Party Characteristics</th>
<th>Model 2 Britain Challenger Status</th>
<th>Model 3 Britain Loss in Polls</th>
<th>Model 4 Britain Gov. Experience</th>
<th>Model 5 Britain Median Party Distance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intercept</strong></td>
<td>28.569*</td>
<td>16.396*</td>
<td>6.694</td>
<td>20.878*</td>
<td>17.780*</td>
<td>12.945*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Opposition Party</strong></td>
<td>6.297*</td>
<td>13.920*</td>
<td>6.804*</td>
<td>5.426*</td>
<td>7.697*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.397)</td>
<td>(0.474)</td>
<td>(0.396)</td>
<td>(0.421)</td>
<td>(0.451)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Loss in Polls</strong></td>
<td>3.233*</td>
<td>2.894*</td>
<td>-0.092</td>
<td>3.265*</td>
<td>3.039*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.375)</td>
<td>(0.360)</td>
<td>(0.462)</td>
<td>(0.374)</td>
<td>(0.375)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Government Experience</strong></td>
<td>-4.512*</td>
<td>-3.446*</td>
<td>-2.695</td>
<td>-9.957*</td>
<td>-0.598</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1.690)</td>
<td>(1.622)</td>
<td>(1.683)</td>
<td>(2.109)</td>
<td>(1.790)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Median Party Distance</strong></td>
<td>0.961*</td>
<td>3.004*</td>
<td>0.903*</td>
<td>0.702</td>
<td>2.008*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.399)</td>
<td>(0.390)</td>
<td>(0.396)</td>
<td>(0.402)</td>
<td>(0.429)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Opposition Party</strong>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>-19.603*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.727)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Loss in Polls</strong>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>8.846*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.732)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Government Experience</strong>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td></td>
<td>13.785*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(3.202)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Median Party Distance</strong>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td></td>
<td>-7.117*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(1.098)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **United Kingdom**  | 11.558    | 12.486                        | 29.926*                          | -5.264                        | 9.533                            | 19.229                              |
|                     | (10.964)  | (10.311)                      | (9.913)                          | (10.718)                      | (10.154)                         | (10.412)                            |

| **σ² Party x Election** | 130.654* | 123.848*                      | 114.074*                         | 121.711*                      | 123.606*                         | 123.228*                            |
|                       | (2.011)  | (1.906)                       | (1.756)                          | (1.873)                       | (1.903)                          | (1.897)                             |
| **σ² Party**         | 342.909* | 301.235*                      | 278.523*                         | 320.894*                      | 291.674*                         | 304.215*                            |
|                       | (95.053) | (83.438)                      | (77.380)                         | (88.833)                      | (81.042)                         | (84.245)                            |
| **σ² Election**      | 50.776*  | 46.535*                       | 41.404*                          | 47.741*                       | 43.920*                          | 46.814*                             |

**Deviance (-2LL)**: 65714.676 65257.794 64559.388 65113.114 65239.323 65215.878

Note: Level 1: Parties in elections N=129 Level 2: Parties N=27/Elections N=23. Standard errors within parentheses. * means significant at the 0.05 level (two-tailed). For the country dummies the reference category is the Netherlands.
Table A.6. The Effects of Party and Election Characteristics on Negative Campaigning in Western Europe

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Model 1 Party Characteristics</th>
<th>Model 1 + Size Electoral Market</th>
<th>Model 1 + Closeness</th>
<th>Model 1 + Continuation Government</th>
<th>Model 1 + Coalition Loss</th>
<th>Model 1 + Interaction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>16.396*</td>
<td>22.204</td>
<td>16.058*</td>
<td>16.424*</td>
<td>17.469*</td>
<td>18.109*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(4.947)</td>
<td>(5.733)</td>
<td>(5.043)</td>
<td>(5.201)</td>
<td>(5.087)</td>
<td>(5.526)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.397)</td>
<td>(0.397)</td>
<td>(0.397)</td>
<td>(0.397)</td>
<td>(0.397)</td>
<td>(0.397)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.375)</td>
<td>(0.375)</td>
<td>(0.375)</td>
<td>(0.375)</td>
<td>(0.375)</td>
<td>(0.375)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government Experience</td>
<td>-4.512*</td>
<td>-4.625*</td>
<td>-4.489*</td>
<td>-4.512*</td>
<td>-4.489*</td>
<td>-4.503*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1.690)</td>
<td>(1.689)</td>
<td>(1.691)</td>
<td>(1.690)</td>
<td>(1.689)</td>
<td>(1.690)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median Party Distance</td>
<td>0.961*</td>
<td>0.944*</td>
<td>0.961*</td>
<td>0.961*</td>
<td>0.965*</td>
<td>0.961*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.399)</td>
<td>(0.399)</td>
<td>(0.399)</td>
<td>(0.399)</td>
<td>(0.399)</td>
<td>(0.399)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Size Electoral Market</td>
<td>-0.350</td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.182)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closeness Election</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.085</td>
<td>-0.085</td>
<td>-0.085</td>
<td>-0.085</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.252)</td>
<td>(4.853)</td>
<td>(4.853)</td>
<td>(4.853)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuation Government</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.085</td>
<td>-0.085</td>
<td>-0.085</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(4.853)</td>
<td>(4.853)</td>
<td>(4.853)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coalition Loss</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-2.436</td>
<td>-2.436</td>
<td>-2.436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(2.862)</td>
<td>(2.862)</td>
<td>(2.862)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuation Government * Coalition Loss</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\sigma^2$ Party x Election</td>
<td>123.848*</td>
<td>123.847*</td>
<td>123.847*</td>
<td>123.847*</td>
<td>123.847*</td>
<td>123.847*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1.906)</td>
<td>(1.906)</td>
<td>(1.906)</td>
<td>(1.906)</td>
<td>(1.906)</td>
<td>(1.906)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\sigma^2$ Party</td>
<td>301.235*</td>
<td>300.957*</td>
<td>300.960*</td>
<td>301.115*</td>
<td>300.911*</td>
<td>300.876*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(83.438)</td>
<td>(83.226)</td>
<td>(83.416)</td>
<td>(83.447)</td>
<td>(83.454)</td>
<td>(83.476)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\sigma^2$ Election</td>
<td>46.535*</td>
<td>39.488*</td>
<td>46.266*</td>
<td>46.536*</td>
<td>44.954*</td>
<td>44.391*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deviance (-2LL)</td>
<td>65257.794</td>
<td>65254.384</td>
<td>65257.684</td>
<td>65257.801</td>
<td>65257.080</td>
<td>65257.816</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Level 1: Parties in elections N=129 Level 2: Parties N=27/Elections N=23. Standard errors within parentheses. * means significant at the 0.05 level (two-tailed). For the country dummies the reference category is the Netherlands.